SHRI NILOTPAL BASU: Have you provided water and power connections?

अल्पसंख्यकों के प्रति भेदभाव

*203. **श्री राजमोहिन्दर सिंह :†**
श्री बरजिन्दर सिंह:

क्या **सामाजिक न्याय और अधिकारिता** मंत्री यह बताने की कृपा करेंगे कि:

(क) क्या सरकार का ध्यान दिनांक 13 नवंबर, 1999 के "डेली आब्जर्वर" में "ताहिर ब्लेम्स दि सिस्टम फार माइनोरिटी डिस्क्रिमीनेशन" शीर्ष से प्रकाशित समाचार की ओर दिलाया गया है;

(ख) यदि हां, तो क्या यह सच है कि अल्पसंख्यक आयोग के अध्यक्ष श्री ताहिर ने यह विचार व्यक्त किया है कि अल्पसंख्यकों के प्रति भेदभाव में मौजूदा व्यवस्था की मुख्य भूमिका है; और

(ग) यदि हां, तो सरकार की इस संबंध में क्या प्रतिक्रिया है और मौजूदा व्यवस्था में व्यापक सुधारों के लिए सरकार द्वारा क्या कार्यवाही किये जाने का विचार है?

सामाजिक न्याय और अधिकारिता मंत्रालय की राज्य मंत्री (श्रीमती मेनका गांधी): (क) जी, हां।

(ख) राष्ट्रीय अल्पसंख्यक आयोग के पदमुक्त अध्यक्ष ने अभिव्यक्त किया है कि उनके विचार में अल्पसंख्यकों की समस्या बहुत पहले से स्थापित व्यवस्था में कमियों के प्रति आरोप्य हैं और आज की सरकार के प्रति नहीं।

(ग) राष्ट्रीय अल्पसंख्यक आयोग के पदमुक्त अध्यक्ष ने विचार अपनी व्यक्तिगत हैसियत से व्यक्त किए हैं। तथापि, सरकार अपने दायित्व से अवगत है और अल्पसंख्यकों के हितों की सुरक्षा करने के लिए संविधान में निहित धर्म निरपेक्ष विशेषता तथा प्रजातांत्रिक मूल्यों को बनाए रखने के लिए वचनबद्ध है और जनता के विभिन्न वर्गों के बीच शांति एवं सांप्रदायिक सद्भाव बनाए रखने के लिए हर कोशिश करेगी।

†सभा में यह प्रश्न श्री राज मोहिन्दर सिंह द्वारा पूछा गया।

Discrimination against Minorities

†203. SHRI RAJ MOHINDER SINGH:††
SHRI BARJINDER SINGH HAMDARD:

Will the Minister of SOCIAL JUSTICE AND EMPOWERMENT be pleased to state:

(a) whether Government's attention has been drawn towards the news-item captioned "Tahir blames the system for minority discrimination", published in the Daily Observer, dated 13th November, 1999;

(b) if so, whether it is a fact that Chairman of the Minority Commission, Mr. Tahir has expressed the view that the present system has a main role in the discrimination towards minorities; and

(c) if so, what is the reaction of Government in this regard and what action has been contemplated by Government for the comprehensive reforms in the present system?

THE MINISTER OF STATE OF THE MINISTRY OF SOCIAL JUSTICE AND EMPOWERMENT (SMT. MANEKA GANDHI): (a) Yes, Sir.

(b) The out-going Chairman, NCM, has expressed that in his opinion, problems of minorities are attributable to the defects in the system established since long and not to the Government of the day

(c) The outgoing Chairman, NCM, has expressed these views in his personal capacity. However, the Government has always been aware of its responsibility and fully committed to uphold the secular character and democratic values enshrined in the Constitution to safeguard the interests of minorities and will spare no efforts to maintain peace and communal hormony amongst various sections of the people.

---

†Original Notice of the Question was received in Hindi.

†† The question was actually asked on the floor of the House by Shri Raj Mohinder Singh.

SHRI RAJ MOHINDER SINGH: Sir, I am not satisfied with the answer. सर, मैं आपके माध्यम से मंत्री महोदया से पूछना चाहता हूं। यह जो ताहिर साहब ने आर्टिकल लगाए हैं, उसमें से मैं बोल रहा हूं—'Condition of minority has been going from bad to worse, but deterioration did not come about in the last one or two years; Mahmood, who lays down office later this month after a three-year term, told INS. And on that count, the State Governments run by the Congress were the worst, he claimed, adding to sensitise them by the Commission's Reports. I had to take up the matter with Sonia Gandhi. आगे चलकर वह लिखते हैं—"The Western media as well as sections of the Indian Press had, by magnifying the attacks on the Christians earlier this year, contributed to create the impression that lot of the minorities had deteriorated under the BJP-led Government. The Western world, which generally did not react when the Muslims were attacked after the demolition of the Babri Masjid in Ayodhya and the Sikhs were targeted after the assassination of the then Prime Minister, Indira Gandhi, by her own bodyguard in October 1984, was quick to take the Christian issue, he said."

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE: Sir, instead of asking the Supplementary, the hon. Member is making a statement on the floor of the House. आप सप्लीमेंटरी पूछिए, न।

श्री राजमोहिन्दर सिंह: कोई मोनोपोली है क्या? कुछ पूछना नहीं है क्या हमने? यह जवाब ही इसलिए आया है कि कुछ पूछें। ...**(व्यवधान)**...

MR. CHAIRMAN: The Government has already got that statement. It need not be read. The Government is replying on the basis of the statement. They already know it. You need not read it. आप सवाल पूछिए।

श्री राज मोहिन्दर सिंह: मैं सवाल पूछ लेता हूं, जैसे आप कहते हैं। मेडिकल कालेज में एडमिशन मांगा बंगाल गर्वनमेंट से, वह नहीं मिला, ऐजुकेशन के लिए केरल से मांगा गया, वह नहीं मिला। दंगे जब होते हैं हिन्दुस्तान में तो उसमें नुकसान कम गिनती वालों का ही होता है, उसमें कभी मेजॉरिटी कम्युनिटी का नुकसान नहीं हुआ। खुशवंत सिंह जी दा आर्टिकल है, तुसी कहो ते मैं पढ़ के सुना दयां।

श्री सभापति: नहीं, नहीं, पढ़न दा सवाल नहीं है, गवर्नमेंट जाणदी है आर्टिकल नूं। आप सवाल करो।

श्री राज मोहिन्दर सिंह: इंडियन आर्म्ड फोर्सिस में जो पंजाबियों और सिखों की भर्ती होती है वह 35-36 परसैंट थी पर्टिशन से पहले और बाद में और बाबू जगजीव राम जी के समय उसको 2 परसैंट कर दिया गया, जिसमें सिख माइनॉरिटि कम्युनिटी की भर्ती 1 परसैंट है। मेरा क्वेश्चन यह है कि हमारी भर्ती तो 1 परसैंट है लेकिन करगिल में हमारे 50 से ज्यादा लड़के शहीद हुए हैं, यह कोई कम्पेरिज़न नहीं है। या तो हमारे लड़के ज्यादा भर्ती करो नहीं तो 1 परसैंट भी मरवाओ। यह मेरी प्ली है, चेयरमैन साहब, आपको, इसका मुझे जवाब दीजिए। चेयरमैन साहब, जब भी लड़ाई होती है, पंजाब के बार्डर पर लड़ाई होती है, पंजाबियों की ज़मीन पर लड़ाई होती है और उसमें हमारे लड़के शहीद होते हैं। इतनी बहादुर कौम के साथ यह हो रहा है, कहां 1 परसैंट और कहां 50 परसैंट, इसका जवाब दीजिए?

SHRIMATI MANEKA GANDHI: I have not understood what he is saying.

श्री राज मोहिन्दर सिंह: मेरा क्वेश्चन यह है कि हमारी भर्ती सारी 1 परसेंट और हमारे लड़के शहीद हुए 50 परसेंट, ऐसा क्यों? हमको तो पंजाब में घुसने नहीं देते, चेयरमैन साहब, आप तो खुद पंजाब से हैं। मंत्री जी, आप इसका जवाब दीजिए कि ऐसा क्यों है?

SHRIMATI MANEKA GANDHI: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I have tried to follow his supplementary to the best of my ability. The hon. Member has made several points. The first point he made was that the former Chairman of the NCM had asked for affiliation of the Dr. Zakir Hussain Medical College, Darbhanga, but they were denied it. The matter is pending before the court.

Secondly, in Calcutta, there was a college which had applied for affiliation. They were not getting the affiliation. Again, the Commission took up the matter with the Government of West Bengal. We are waiting for their reply.

The third thing the hon. member said was about the Army. Now, I do not have specific statistics about the Army. He himself has given the statistics. He said that it is 6 per cent or 1 per cent. When they die, they are 50 per cent. I do not know what kind of response I have to give for that. He has given the statistics.

श्री सभापति: कोई सैकिंड सप्लीमेंटरी है?

श्री राज मोहिन्दर सिंह: 1 और 50 की रेश्यो है जी, 1 परसैंट भर्ती और 50 परसैंट शहीदी हुई तो यह तो क्वेश्चन ही माइनॉरिटी को बिलांग करता है जी।

MR. CHAIRMAN: That's all.

†श्री मोहम्मद सलीमः सर, सवाल यह था कि माइनॉरिटी के खिलाफ जो डिस्क्रिमिनेशन है, डिस्क्रिमिनेशन अगेंस्ट माइनॉरिटी और जैसे आपने कहा कि नेशनल कमीशन आन माइनॉरिटी के जो चेयरमैन थे, मिस्टर ताहिर, उनकी रिपोर्टस वगैरह हैं।

In part (b) the Minister says, "The outgoing Chairman of the NCM in his present capacity has said so."

'सी' कवेश्चन, यदि इसका मतलब है कि अगर डिस्क्रिमिनेशन है माइनॉरिटी के खिलाफ तो

"(c) If so, what is the reaction of Government in this regard and what action has been contemplated by Government for the comprehensive reforms in the present system?" The former Chairman of the NCM says, "..because of the system, discrimination against the minorities is going on."

"The Government is fully committed to uphold the secular character and democratic values enshrined in the Constitution to safeguard the interest of the minorities and will spare no efforts to maintain peace and communal harmony amongst various sections of the people."

Sir, in regard to education, employment and empowerment, the discrimination against the minorities is going on, and you will agree that not only the Minority Commissions in their successive reports have referred to this issue but also the successive Governments and the Ministers have been delivering lectures on this issue. But when a specific question is put as to what the Ministry is contemplating to do to reform the system so that the discrimination against the minorities in regard to their education, employment and empowerment is removed, they will say that this will keep the communal harmony. That is the bonus they are giving to the citizens of the country belonging to the minority communities. Okay. Nobody will loot your houses, nobody will burn your houses, nobody will rape your women, nobody will arrest you unnecessarily.

उनको अपनी शहरी जिंदगी बिताने के लिए जो सहूलियतें चाहिए, चाहे वे शहर में हों या गांव में हों, उनको जो सहूलियतें चाहिए, उसके लिए आप क्या कर रही हैं?

† Transliteration of the speech in Persian Script is available in the Hindi version of the Debate.

The name of your Ministry is the Ministry of Social Justice and Empowerment. इसलिए उनकी एजूकेशन, एमपावरमेंट, इम्प्लॉयमेंट के बारे में जो डिस्क्रिमिनेशन है, उसको रिमूव करने के लिए आप क्या कदम उठाएंगी, सवाल यह है।

SHRIMATI MANEKA GANDHI: Sir, the reason as to why the answer was kept vague is that the question was about the system and not about the Government. But since the hon. Member has put a question to me, I am going to answer it. It is a long answer involving so many schemes, and, Sir, if you allow me to answer, I will answer the same. Sir, apart from having the National Commission for Minorities, which looks into individual complaints, the positive features on education are, number one, there are various programmes for the safety and welfare of minorities which fall within the purview of the Ministry of Human Resource Development. Then there is an area intensive programme for the educationally backward minorities, there is a scheme for the modernisation of Madarsas where a lot of money is being kept, there is a scheme through which financial assistance is given for the appointment of Urdu teachers, a grant of honorarium for teaching Urdu, there is a scheme of coaching classes for competitive examination, there is a scheme for providing assistance under the community polytechnics, there are various programmes of elementary education, that is, the Operation Blackboard, the Mid-Day Meal Scheme, Teachers Training for Non-formal Education, there is a Minority Education and District Primary Programme. All these programmes are going on. The Maulana Azad Institute has funded 293 major institutions in the field of modernisation. There is a Wakf Council which also gives money. Is this the answer that the hon. Member wanted from me?

SHRI MD. SALIM: I didn't ask for the existing on-going projects and schemes. The successive Governments announce them. My question was: "What is the reason for discrimination against the minorities? If the system does not respond to the causes of the discrimination, how do you contemplate to reform the system, a communal mindset? How do you propose to safeguard the interests of the minorities?" *(Interruptions)* The simple question is that the Government, which is supposed to remove the hinderances, if they feel that removing of discrimination against the minorities means

appeasing the minorities, then how can this discrimination against the minorities removed? *(Interruptions)*

SHRI NARENDRA MOHAN:*

MR. CHAIRMAN: Now, Mr. Narendra Mohan has taken over the job of the Minister. I hope he is not a Minister. His reply will not be noted down.

SHRIMATI MANEKA GANDHI: Again, Sir, discrimination is more an opinion than an established fact. I will just give you one example. There used to be an allegation made very frequently that the minorities do not find place in the State Police. Let us just look at the representation of the minorities in the State Police force. It is 16.7 per cent *(Interruptions)*

SHRI MD. SALIM: Are you referring to the State Police?

SHRIMATI MANEKA GANDHI: Yes.

SHRI MD. SALIM: To which State are you referring to?

SHRIMATI MANEKA GANDHI: An average of the State Police is 16.7 per cent.

MISS SAROJ KHAPARDE: Sir, may I ask the hon. Minister....

MR. CHAIRMAN: How can you ask? How can you ask? I have not called you. Let her reply first. I have not called you.

SHRIMATI MANEKA GANDHI: This is an aggregate made by the Deputy Commissioner and the District Collectors who monitor the programme, who have sent us these figures, and it averages out at 16.40 per cent because the UTs have 10 per cent, the State of 16.7 per cent, and all States and UTs have 16.40 per cent. The Central Police Organisation has 11.5 per cent. The Central Ministries and the Departments have 10.4 per cent, and the public sector undertakings' figure is, perhaps, the lowest. It is 8.9 per cent. So, again, when you talk about discrimination, it really does not exist. Because a portion of the minorities educationally need help, there is a huge amount of infrastructure going in to provide them special help.

SHRI MD. SALIM: Sir,.....

* Not recorded.

MR. CHAIRMAN: No, no, no, no, no, no. Venkaiah Naidu. ...*(Interruptions)*... No, no. ...*(Interruption)*... No, please; no, please; no, please. Finished ...*(Interruption)*... No, no, no, no. ...*(Interruption)*... No. Venkaiah Naidu. ...*(Interruption)*... Don't reply. Please don't reply.

SHRI M. VENKAIAH NAIDU: Mr. Chairman, Sir, I want to humbly submit, before I put a question, that unintentionally, a message is going to the people as if there is discrimination in this country against the minorities. I am happy that the Minister has clarified it. We have seen in this great country that even the offices of the President of India, the Chief Justice of India, the Cricket Captain of India or of other film personalities, and many other premier posts in Air Force and other Departments were held by the minorities. It is a privilege of this great nation. Sir, my question is whether the Ministry has received any specific complaints from the Minorities Commission and whether they had made any recommendation to end the discrimination if, at all, any case has come to their notice. And thirdly, if not the Minorities Commission, whether any other organisation or public sector undertaking people have brought to the notice of the Government, particularly, the Minister of Social Justice and Empowerment, any sort of discrimination in any field of public activity in this country.

SHRIMATI MANEKA GANDHI: Sir, The Minorities Commission's job is to investigate specific areas where people feel that they have been discriminated against. Now, like in all the Commissions, specific personal complaints come in and the Minorities Commission deals with them. The Minorities Commission, in its Report, has also made specific recommendations, perhaps, to make India better not only for the minorities but for everybody else also in the country, and the Government has taken cognizance of them, and every Ministry is working to see if these complaints can be removed.

THE LEADER OF OPPOSITION (DR. MANMOHAN SINGH): Sir, yesterday, a leading newspaper, "The Hindustan Times", carried in a column by Mr. Khushwant Singh, a very shocking news with regard to a study undertaken by a serving member of the Indian Police Service about the massive discrimination that takes place against the minorities, what happens during the communal riots.

Would the hon. Minister assure us that she would look into that Report and come back to the House with a proper statement?

SHRIMATI MANEKA GANDHI: Sir, I have not seen that Report. When and if I look at that Report, then only I can give you an answer.

SHRI PRANAB MUKHERJEE: You do have a look at it and come back to the House.

SHRIMATI MANEKA GANDHI: I will have a look at it.

†**मौलाना ओबैदुल्ला खान आज़मी:** सर, इल्जाम-दर-इल्जाम के माहौल में कोई भी बात साफ समझ में नहीं आ रही है और मॉयनोरिटी की जो हालत है वह सब पर रोशन है। सर, मैं यह भी अर्ज करना चाहता हूं कि गोपाल सिंह कमेटी श्रीमती इंदिरा गांधी जी के जमाने में बनी थी और दस साल के बाद श्री वी०पी० सिंह साहब के जमाने में वह पार्लियामेंट में लाई गई थी। अब कितने जमाने के बाद उस पर चर्चा होगी और कितने जमाने के बाद उस पर बहस होगी यह बात नहीं समझ में आती। मेरी गुजारिश यह है कि गोपाल सिंह कमेटी को क्या यह सरकार सभा पटल पर लाकर के उस पर चर्चा करवाएगी? अगर उस पर चर्चा हो जाती है तो ढोल का पोल खुल जाएगा कि कौन कितने पानी में है, सारी बात समझ में आ जाएगी। जो कुछ भी गलत-सलत दावे किए जा रहे हैं उनकी भी कलई खुल जाएगी। तो क्या सरकार उस पर बहस कराने के लिए तैयार है ताकि दूध का दूध और पानी का पानी साफ हो जाए?

SHRIMATI MANEKA GANDHI: Sir, action taken against the person is outside the scope of this question. This is outside the scope of this question. I am not aware of the Gopal Singh Committee Report in my Ministry. We can have a look at it. If ten years ago ...*(Interruption)*...

SHRI MD. SALIM: Sir, it is Gvoernment of India's high powered committee.

SHRIMATI MANEKA GANDHI: I know that.

मौलाना ओबैदुल्ला खान आज़मी: गवर्नमेंट को नहीं मालूम तो मॉयनोरिटी की चिंता क्या होगी।

---

† Transliteration of the speech in persion script is available in the Hindi version of the Debate.

SHRI MD. SALIM: How is it that the Government is not aware of it?

SHRIMATI MANEKA GANDHI: At no stage, has it come to my Ministry. The Gopalsingh Committee report has not been taken up by my Ministry at all. If and when it does come ...*(Interruption)*.

†**श्री मोहम्मद सलीम:** जब वेलफेयर मिनिस्ट्री थी, सोशल जस्टिस उसमें नहीं था तो उस ज़माने में गोपाल सिंह कमेटी की रिपोर्ट अगस्त, 1990 में यहां पर राज्य सभा में रखी गई थी। यह कमेटी 1980 में बनी थी to go into the details of discrimination against the minorities and about their empowerment. अभी वेलफेयर मिनिस्ट्री, सोशल जस्टिस एंड इम्पावरमेंट मिनिस्ट्री बन गई है जबकि माइनारिटीज़ का दफ्तर भी वहीं पर है तो कम से कम सरकार को इतना इनसेंसेटिव तो नहीं होना चाहिये कि जो रिपोर्ट 20 साल पहले बनी और वह रिपोर्ट 10 साल पहले यहां रखी गई उस रिपोर्ट को भूल जाएं और यहां पर चर्चा भी न हो और अमल भी न हो। माइनारिटीज़ की हालत क्या इससे पता चलता है इस मुल्क में।

†**मौलाना ओबैदुल्ला खान आज़मी:** यह बड़ा अहम सवाल है। क्या सरकार इस रिपोर्ट को यहां पर लाएगी और बहस कराएगी?

औद्योगिक उत्पादन की वार्षिक विकास दर

*204. **श्री कपिल सिब्बल:** †
श्री बरजिन्दर सिंह:

क्या **वाणिज्य और उद्योग** मंत्री यह बताने की कृपा करेंगे कि:

(क) क्या यह सच है कि औद्योगिक उत्पादन की वार्षिक विकास दर में गत वर्ष की तुलना में बढ़ोतरी होने की संभावना है;

(ख) यदि हां, तो वर्ष 1998-99 के दौरान वास्तविक विकास दर क्या थी;

(ग) चालू वर्ष में विकास दर कितनी होने का अनुमान है और क्या सरकार ने उन उद्योगों का भी पता लगाया है जिनमें गत वर्ष की तुलना में विकास दर बढ़ी है या कम हुई है; और

(घ) यदि हां, तो ऐसे उद्योग कौन-कौन से है जिनमें विकास दर बढ़ रही है अथवा कम हो रही है?

---

† Transliteration of the Speech in Persian Script is available in the Hindi Version of the Debate.

† सभा में यह प्रश्न **श्री कपिल सिब्बल** द्वारा पूछा गया।